



2008 Undergraduate Research Award Essay Evaluation Guidelines

	Beginning (0 -5 points)	Competent (6-10 points)	Excellent (11 - 15 points)	Points (0 – 15)
Research Strategy				
Research Process	Search strategies described, but no demonstrated clear understanding of process. Merely follows lead given by instructor.	Search strategies explicitly described, along with successes and dead-ends. Shows some comprehension of research process. Demonstrates some independence and initiative in research.	Search strategies explicitly described. Consideration of what made a source useful or not useful. Demonstrates deeper understanding of research process and a high level of independence and initiative in research.	
Search Tools	Uses basic tools, such as GIL, Google, Google Scholar, GALILEO Quick Search.	Uses more tools and pathfinders, GALILEO general full-text databases or subject databases.	Uses complex tools, such as WorldCat, archival finding aids, and specialized databases.	
Search Techniques	Uses keyword searching; browses library stacks; views initial results from electronic resources.	Modifies searches iteratively; identifies new keywords; uses subject headings; follows footnotes & references.	Modifies searches iteratively; uses search limits; identifies key authors and subject headings; follows footnotes & references iteratively; uses cited reference searching.	
Library Collections	Uses UGA Libraries' and other libraries' collections superficially.	Digs deeper into UGA Libraries' and other libraries' collections & services. Includes some primary or multi-media sources (Humanities/Social Sciences) or performs adequate literature review (Sciences).	Exploits UGA Libraries' and other libraries' collections and services to the fullest. Enhances project through the use of primary and/or multi-media sources (Humanities/Social Sciences) or performs exhaustive literature review (Sciences).	
Librarian Consultation	Meets with UGA Librarian, allowing for reasonable time for research after meeting.	Shows evidence of incorporating Librarian's recommended resources and techniques.	Integrates librarian's recommendations; goes beyond with independent discoveries and search strategies.	

	Beginning (0 - 5 points)	Competent (6 - 10 points)	Excellent (11 - 15 points)	Points (0 – 15)
Sources Used				
Types & Formats	Uses basic sources (books, websites, articles).	Uses broader array of information sources.	Seeks out a wide variety of source types used in the discipline. Selects the most appropriate type/format to support their research.	
Breadth & Depth	Finds obvious references from familiar sources.	Finds references from a variety of sources and disciplines.	Finds references from multiple perspectives, pursuing comprehensive coverage.	
Evaluation & Selection	Assesses the relevance of sources.	Evaluates the relevance and quality of sources.	Carefully evaluates the relevance and quality of sources; considers authority, accuracy, currency, objectivity and coverage.	
Citation Style	Cites all materials, but not in a standard or consistent way.	Cites all materials in a consistent way, for the most part.	Cites all materials properly using a discipline-appropriate bibliographic style.	
Essay				
Originality	Describes research process in a straight-forward manner.	Demonstrates some amount of uniqueness.	Essay shows exceptional creativity.	
Personal Learning & Understanding	Develops a basic understanding of library research.	Develops a deeper understanding. Attains adequate skills required for senior level undergraduate research.	Develops a thorough understanding, approaching graduate level research.	
Overall Quality	Writing is grammatically correct.	Writing has clarity and coherent organization.	Writing demonstrates clarity, engaging language, and sophisticated stylistic quality.	
Total Points:				

Adapted from the University of California at Berkeley's, Evaluation Criteria for the Library Prize: Illustrative Examples.
Revised August 2007